

DzGrav

ARC Centre of Excellence for Gravitational Wave Discovery

Searches for gravitational waves

Xingjiang Zhu

OzGrav-Monash

Outline

- Data analysis techniques
- Recent search results

- 1) An isotropic stochastic GW background
- 2) Individual inspiralling supermassive BBHs

^o (Burst with memory, cosmic strings, inflationary GWs ...)

Pulsar timing arrays

• Foster & Backer 1990

CONSTRUCTING A PULSAR TIMING ARRAY

R. S. FOSTER and D. C. BACKER

Astronomy Department, Radio Astronomy Laboratory, and Center for Particle Astrophysics, University of California at Berkeley Received 1989 October 23; accepted 1990 March 21

ABSTRACT

Arrival time data from a spatial array of millisecond pulsars can be used (1) to provide a time standard for long time scales, (2) to detect perturbations of the Earth's orbit, and (3) to search for a cosmic background of gravitational radiation. In this paper we first develop a polynomial time series representation for these three effects that is appropriate for analysis of the present data with its limited degrees of freedom. We then describe a pulsar timing array program that we have established at the National Radio Astronomy Observatory 43 m telescope with observations of PSR 1620-26, PSR 1821-24, and PSR 1937+21. The results presented in this paper cover a 2 yr period beginning in 1987 July. Individual parameters of these objects are compared to previous measurements. The influence of global parameters—clock, Earth location, and effects of gravitational radiation—on our data is discussed in the context of our polynomial model. Improvements in the data-gathering hardware and the inclusion of data from other observatories will lead to a significant increase in the sensitivity of this effort in the near future.

Subject headings: instruments - pulsars

ASTROPHYSICS

Gravitational waves from binary supermassive black holes missing in pulsar observations

R. M. Shannon,^{1,2*} V. Ravi,^{3*} L. T. Lentati,⁴ P. D. Lasky,⁵ G. Hobbs,¹ M. Kerr,¹ R. N. Manchester,¹ W. A. Coles,⁶ Y. Levin,⁵ M. Bailes,³ N. D. R. Bhat,² S. Burke-Spolaor,⁷ S. Dai,^{1,8} M. J. Keith,⁹ S. Osłowski,^{10,11} D. J. Reardon,⁵ W. van Straten,³ L. Toomey,¹ J.-B. Wang,¹² L. Wen,¹³ J. S. B. Wyithe,¹⁴ X.-J. Zhu¹³

Gravitational waves are expected to be radiated by supermassive black hole binaries formed during galaxy mergers. A stochastic superposition of gravitational waves from all such binary systems would modulate the arrival times of pulses from radio pulsars. Using observations of millisecond pulsars obtained with the Parkes radio telescope, we constrained the characteristic amplitude of this background, $A_{c,yn}$ to be <1.0 × 10⁻¹⁵ with 95% confidence. This limit excludes predicted ranges for $A_{c,yr}$ from current models with 91 to 99.7% probability. We conclude that binary evolution is either stalled or dramatically accelerated by galactic-center environments and that higher-cadence and shorterwavelength observations would be more sensitive to gravitational waves.



Studying the Solar system with the International Pulsar Timing Array

MNRAS 000, 1-17 (2016)

Preprint 12 May 2019

Compiled using MNRAS IATEX style file v3.0

A pulsar-based timescale from the international pulsar timing array

A galactic-scale GW detector: the Pulsar Timing Array



One realization of an isotropic GWB



Image credit: Rutger van Haasteren

One realization of a continuous wave



Image credit: Rutger van Haasteren

Let us find some GWs



Data look like



		المعرد التقاريق المحا	I J0437-4715
		i la i la comuna.	0.46µs
. تأسير فوقت والتأثير	in the state	معمل حوار دينية الراق	I J0613-0200
		in a sur si a su	⁻ 7.56μs
ويفعد مقلومة ألف	تارو موالة مل		J0711-6830
	1. 1.		39.79µs
and and a state in the second s	I III I		J1022+1001
	<u> </u>		22.75µs
فللدحم والمتأقف وتتأقله	أبرا أشفده	فأربعهم بعيمارك	J1024-0719
			* 22.33μs
	و الم	أحمد والمعمين ليقط	J1045-4509
			24.74µs
A DESCRIPTION OF A DESC	يري المريد من المريد	ومرجوعا والمراجع والمراجع	J1600-3053
			7 <i>.</i> 44µs
		ويتعاد والمتحد والمتحد والمرافع	J1603-7202
<u></u>			[•] 11.58με
	, in the second s	a second a s	J1643-1224
	<u> </u>	1 1	13.93µs
	14 H .	马利·利利 ·利利	J1713+0747
	11.11.	The Property of the Property o	₩ 2.47µs
ومانعة وترتقا فراو	. ال مد د اله.	Since Party in the second	J1730-2304
Tavi Time - 131	-I		16.34µn
ويوريها فأربا والمستند	i de la secola da la		J1732-5049
	 _		25.22µs
			J1744-1134
			9.53µs
A CONTRACTOR OF A CONTRACTOR	and the second second	and the second second	J1824-2452A
		· · · · ·	16.91µs
فراد المتشتية والما		ويعرقون إسرابته أواقهما	J1857+0943
	I I I		8.00µø
····		i da ante a construction de la construction de la construcción de la construcción de la construction de la cons	··· J1909-3744
	F 1-	-	1.93µs
	ا مەربى يەربى يەربى ¹	and the second	- J1939+2134
			4.61µa
		and the second	. J2124-3358
	<u>i it</u>		28.23µs
l i s de jugation	بوايقه في دوري		J2129-5721
			35.16µs
- The state of the second s		متحط معاودا مانه	 J2145-0750
<u>, 1, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , </u>	-, +		41.61µs
2006	2008	2010	0
			7

Problems

- 1. Pulsar timing model
- 2. Noise model
- 3. Signal (GW) model
- 4. Computational challenges

1. Pulsar timing model



11

The effect of fitting on a GWB



The effect of fitting on a CW



Image credit: Rutger van Haasteren

2. Noise model

✓ TOA errors

- Additional white noise (pulse jitter, scintillation,)
- Red noise (or "timing" noise, spin noise)
- ISM noise
- ^o Instrumental jumps
- ^o RFIs, SSE, clocks

White noise MMMMMMMMMMMMMMMMMMM

radiometer noise + puls

pulse jitter

+ scintillation noise

Larger telescope, lower noise receivers, longer integration times, larger bandwidths



Longer integrations (more sensitivity not a help)

Slide adapted from Jim Cordes

Longer integrations, higher bandwidths and frequencies



20/05/19

Timing noise: Spin/torque noise in

core and magnetospheres



• PSR B1937+21



					Hobbs et al. 20	10	
0011+47 0.0.362 0.0292		0031-07 1999-05 20 199-01		0034-0634 0.0004 0.2092		0037+56 4,7802 4,2748	()前傳轉動時 (#
0045+33 0.0124 0.0102	1110 Martin	0052+51 0.0112 0.0053	11 Million Starth Inte	0053+47 0.0436 0.0924	and the state of t	0059+85 0.1678 0.0998	~
0105+65 0,6601 0,5143	- 7 /	0105+68 0.0173 0.0162		0108-1431 0,0316 0,0392	finiteling the	0114+58 0.9431 9.2973	\sim
01.34-29.37 0.001.3 0.0097		0136+57 0.2927 1.0745	$\langle n \rangle $	0138+59 0.0080 0.0065	······································	0144+59 0.0164 0.0836	$\langle \rangle \sim$
0149-16 0.0398 0.0478		0153+39 45.1657 24.9319		0154+61 0.1147 0.0488	\sim	0215+8218 0.0055 0.0100	Wh.
0218+4232 0,0003 0,1229		0226+70 0.0118 0.0081		0301+19 0.0313 0.0225	· ····································	0320+39 0,8147 0,8049	enne Salatatere
9329+54 00388 0.043	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	0.331+45 0.0031 0.0114		0.339+53 0.0360 0.0186	·) · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	0.353+52 0.0082 0.0316	
0402+61 0.1232 0.2072	L	0410+89 0.0050 0.0127	Hand Land States Fint.	0421-0345 0.0084 0.0039	Present () his	0448-2749 0.0068 0.0151	·****
0447-12 0.0128 0.0292		0450-18 0.1187 0.2162		0450+55 0.2466 0.7237	~~~./	0459-0210 0.0106 0.0093	ĝena i i i
0458+46 0.0557 0.0872	<u> </u>	0520-2553 0.0024 0.0099	Millin.	0.0024 0.0068		0.0291	
0538+2817 0,0527 0,3682	~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~	0540+23 0.5301 2.1552	<	0609+37 0,0167 0,0561		0613-0200 0.0003 0.0955	Minister of
0611+22 8.8730 25.7435	\sim	0621+1002 0.0003 0.0100	Niger i Hora	0621-04 0.0088 0.0085	in feit inficite .	0626+24 0.0758 0.0537	$\sim \sim \sim$
0628-28 0.4954 0.3981	~/	0643+80 (0.0106 0.0087	Maincinsteineritäkka, lain	0656+14 0.7737 2.0102	\sim	0855+84 0.0048 0.0246	-
0725-1635 0.0038 0.0090		0727-18 0.5837 1.1441	1	0740-28 0.8130 4.8754	$\sim \sim$	0751+1807 0.0003 0.0858	
0751+32 0.0128 0.0089		0809+74 0.0093 0.0072		0818-13 0.0041 0.0033	Sind a state of the state of the	0820+02 0.0110 0.0127	
0823-86 0.4958 0.4314		0826-34 0.0896 0.0484	1. 1999年1月1日	0834+06 2,5887 2,0323		0844-35 0.0124 0.0111	1 4111
0841+80 0.0222 0.0139		0853-33 0.0162 0.0128	President de la des	0906-17 0.0068 0.0169	"Philip and a second	0917+63 0,0056 0,0036	
0919+05 0.7083 1.6448	~	0.0259 0.0238		0942-13 0.0039 0.0069	المجاد وبالمطلط فالما الما المعاديد.	0943+10 190.8246 173.8394	" They are of
0950+08 0.0461 0.1822	\sim	1010-23 0.0287 0.0114	NIL MARY	1012+5307 0,0623 11,8531		1016-16 0.0190 0.0105	tolding with the
1022+1001 0.0002 0.0103		1024-0719 0.0004 0.0868		1034-3224 0.0154 0.0134	(Binditi a) 1	1039-19 0.0137 0.0099	
1047-3032 0.0141 0.0428	141 H	1112+50 0.0127 0.0076		1133+18 0.0365 0.0334		1141-3107 0.2455 0.4560	Λ./
1141-3322 0.0303 0.1041	<u>^-</u>	1238+21 0.0106 0.0095	机制制	1237+25 0.0210 0.0102		1254-10 0.0103 0.0167	-
1257+12 0.0005 0.0767		1.309-12 0.0071 0.0159		1322+83 0.0385 0.0575	Jeter Metalaping - Her	1332-3032 0.0811 0.1247	16
1455-3330 0,0004 0,0524		1508+55 0.5567 0.7526		1518+4904 0,0002 0.0059	in the state	1530+27 0.0225 0.0200	marini fice and

ISM noise



2. Likelihood & noise model Stprf I NAS

$$\delta t = \delta t^{T} + \mathbf{M} \boldsymbol{\xi},$$

$$P(\delta t | \boldsymbol{\xi}, \boldsymbol{\phi}) = \frac{1}{\sqrt{(2\pi)^{n} \det C}}$$

$$\times \exp\left(\frac{-1}{2} \left(\delta t - \mathbf{M} \boldsymbol{\xi}\right)^{\mathrm{T}} \mathbf{C}^{-1} \left(\delta t - \mathbf{M} \boldsymbol{\xi}\right)$$

$$\int d^{m} \boldsymbol{\xi} P(\delta t | \boldsymbol{\xi}, \boldsymbol{\phi}) = \frac{\sqrt{\det\left(\mathbf{M}^{\mathrm{T}} \mathbf{C}^{-1} \mathbf{M}\right)^{-1}}}{\sqrt{(2\pi)^{n-m} \det \mathbf{C}}}$$

$$\times \exp\left(\frac{-1}{2} \delta t^{\mathrm{T}} \mathbf{C}' \delta t\right),$$



with

64

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbf{C}' &= \mathbf{C}^{-1} - \mathbf{C}^{-1} \mathbf{M} \left(\mathbf{M}^{\mathrm{T}} \mathbf{C}^{-1} \mathbf{M} \right)^{-1} \mathbf{M}^{\mathrm{T}} \mathbf{C}^{-1}. \\ \sigma_{s}^{2} &= (\mathrm{EFAC}\sigma)^{2} + \mathrm{EQUAD}^{2}. \\ P(f) &= \frac{A^{2}}{12\pi^{2}} \mathrm{yr}^{3} \left(\frac{f}{\mathrm{yr}^{-1}} \right)^{-\gamma}. \end{aligned} \qquad \begin{aligned} \sigma_{s}^{2} &= \mathrm{T2EFAC}^{2} (\sigma^{2} + \mathrm{T2EQUAD}^{2}) \\ P(f) &= \frac{P_{0}}{\left[1 + \left(\frac{f}{f_{c}} \right)^{2} \right]^{\alpha/2}}, \end{aligned}$$

3. Signal model



PTA single-source vs LIGO



GWB and single source



GWB: low-f turn over



$$h_c(f) = A_{\rm GWB} \frac{(f/{\rm yr}^{-1})^{\alpha}}{(1 + (f_{\rm bend}/f)^{\kappa})^{1/2}}$$

- Low frequency part of spectrum (when black holes are further away) possibly determined by environmental effects (solution to last parsec problem):
 - Stellar Hardening (stellar density) in galactic cores)
 - Circumbinary disk interaction (mass accretion rate)
 - Orbital eccentricity (effects of stars/gas)

Slide adapted from Jim Cordes



GWB: high-f amplitude





- High frequencies (when black holes are close) dominated by GW emission so spectrum determined by:
 - Galaxy Merger Rates
 - Stalling fraction
 - Black hole-host correlations (i.e., M-sigma, M-M_bulge)



Slide adapted from Jim Cordes

A continuous wave



Detecting a GWB



Detecting a single source

 $r(t,\hat{\Omega}) = F_{+}(\hat{\Omega})\Delta A_{+}(t) + F_{\times}(\hat{\Omega})\Delta A_{\times}(t),$ $\Delta A_{+,\times}(t) = A_{+,\times}(t) - A_{+,\times}(t_{p})$



Global fitting for single-source GWs

- In TEMPO2, we can include additionally r_{GW}(t) in pulsar timing models, and fit simultaneously for singlesource GW signals and normal timing parameters for individual pulsars
- Search for GW signals of interest in the two output time series

$$r(t,\hat{\Omega}) = F_{+}(\hat{\Omega})\Delta A_{+}(t) + F_{\times}(\hat{\Omega})\Delta A_{\times}(t)$$



Zhu et al. 2014, Madison et al. 2016

4. Computational challenges

$$p(\mathbf{n}|\vec{\theta}) = \frac{1}{\sqrt{\det(2\pi\Sigma_n)}} \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2}\mathbf{n}^T\Sigma_n^{-1}\mathbf{n}\right),$$
$$\Sigma_n = \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{N}_1 & \mathbf{X}_{12} & \cdots & \mathbf{X}_{1M} \\ \mathbf{X}_{12} & \mathbf{N}_2 & \cdots & \mathbf{X}_{2M} \\ \vdots & \vdots & \ddots & \vdots \\ \mathbf{X}_{M1} & \mathbf{X}_{M2} & \cdots & \mathbf{N}_M \end{bmatrix},$$

High Dimensionality (up to hundreds of parameters), big data sets (10⁴ – 10⁵ TOAs)

• Low-rank approximations for large stationary covariance matrices (*Lentati*+13, *van Haasteren & Vallisneri 15*)

$$C(\tau) = \int_{0}^{\infty} df S(f) \cos(2\pi f \tau).$$

$$= \sum_{k} \rho_{k} \cos(2\pi f_{k} \tau),$$

$$f_{k} = k/T, \quad \rho_{k} = S(f_{k})\Delta f = S(f_{k})/T,$$

$$(\mathbf{N} + \mathbf{K})^{-1} \simeq (\mathbf{N} + \mathbf{F} \Phi \mathbf{F}^{\mathrm{T}})^{-1}$$

$$\simeq \mathbf{N}^{-1} - \mathbf{N}^{-1} \mathbf{F} (\Phi^{-1} + \mathbf{F}^{\mathrm{T}} \mathbf{N}^{-1} \mathbf{F})^{-1} \mathbf{F}^{\mathrm{T}} \mathbf{N}^{-1},$$

$$\mathbf{F} \text{ is } n \times m \text{ (with } m \ll n) \text{ and } \Phi \text{ is diagonal}$$

28

Recent results: SMBBH-GWB limits

- Shannon et al.
 (2015) *Science* 349, 1552
- PPTA 11-yr data, four best pulsars
- Constraints on GWB from SMBBHs



Recent results

Most stringent constraints on cosmic strings



NANOGrav 11-yr Arzoumanian et al. 2018

Figure 12. Constraints on cosmic-string tension, $G\mu/c^2$, as a function of reconnection probability, p, with the NANOGrav 11 year data set. The excluded region of parameter space is bounded by a solid black line. The corresponding excluded region for the NANOGrav nine-year data set (NG9b) is bounded by a dashed black line, while the EPTA constraints (Lentati et al. 2015) are shown for p = 1 only.

Recent results: CW limits

- Black: PPTA DR1
- Red: DR2 expected

- 3C 66B is not a binary (Zhu+19)
- PSOJ334 is probably not a binary (Liu+16)
- Many CRTS candidates are likely not binaries (Sesana+18)



Recent results: CW sensitivity



Implications for individual SMBH binaries

Constraints on mass ratios for the hypothetic SMBBHs

- Direct dynamical measurements of nearby SMBHs
- 2) the most massive early type galaxies within 108
 Mpc
- For M_t >5x10⁹M_☉ (e.g., NGC 4889, NGC 4486, NGC 4649, and NGC 1600), mass ratio < a few percent



Mass Ratio Constraints

DETECTING THE STOCHASTIC GRAVITATIONAL WAVE BACKGROUND USING PULSAR TIMING

FREDRICK A. JENET,¹ GEORGE B. HOBBS,² K. J. LEE,³ AND RICHARD N. MANCHESTER² Received 2005 February 13; accepted 2005 April 19; published 2005 May 9

ABSTRACT

The direct detection of gravitational waves is a major goal of current astrophysics. We provide details of a new method for detecting a stochastic background of gravitational waves using pulsar timing data. Our results show that regular timing observations of 40 pulsars each with a timing accuracy of 100 ns will be able to make a direct detection of the predicted stochastic background from coalescing black holes within 5 years. With an improved prewhitening algorithm, or if the background is at the upper end of the predicted range, a significant detection should be possible with only 20 pulsars.

- ✓ Expected sensitivity for a GWB
- ✓ Populations of SMBBHs
- ✓ Direct search for individual SMBBHs out to ~100 Mpc
- Detection could be imminent; but be patient as signal cycle human lifetime
- New facilities (UWL, MeerKAT, FAST, ... SKA), new pulsars
- Multimessenger search!

